

**The Week That Was: 2015-11-21 (November 21, 2015)**  
**Brought to You by SEPP ([www.SEPP.org](http://www.SEPP.org))**  
**The Science and Environmental Policy Project**

#####

**Quote of the Week:** *“It must be remembered that there is nothing more difficult to plan, more doubtful of success, nor more dangerous to manage than a new system. For the initiator has the enmity of all who would profit by the preservation of the old institution and merely lukewarm defenders in those who gain by the new ones.” – Niccolò Machiavelli*

#####

**Number of the Week:** \$16.5 Trillion

#####

**THIS WEEK:**

**By Ken Haapala, President, Science and Environmental Policy Project (SEPP)**

**Attribution:** With each successive report the UN Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) becomes more certain in attributing recent climate change to human influence. That is, that human influence, particularly carbon dioxide emissions (CO<sub>2</sub>), is the specific cause of climate change. This intensification of certainty is particularly noticeable in a trend from Third Assessment Report (AR3, 2001), to the Fourth Assessment Report (AR4, 2007) to the Fifth Assessment Report (AR5, 2013 & 2014). Specifically, AR5 states:

*“It is **extremely likely** that more than half of the observed increase in global average surface temperature from 1951 to 2010 was caused by the anthropogenic increase in greenhouse gas concentrations and other anthropogenic forcings together. The best estimate of the human induced contribution to warming is similar to the observed warming over this period.”*

“Extremely likely” is defined as 95% to 100% probability. According to an assertion in AR3, “*The most we can expect to achieve is the prediction of the probability distribution of the system's future possible states by the generation of ensembles of model solutions.*” (Section 14.2.2.2, discussed in last week’s TWTW). There is no established probability distribution presented. Thus, the term “extremely likely” is more based on the opinion of the political actors writing the SPM, than on any objective probability distribution.

Yet, Section C, Drivers of Climate Change, in the Summary for Policymakers (SPM) states a Very High level of confidence in the warming influence from CO<sub>2</sub> of 1.68 W/m squared, with a range of 1.33 to 2.03. This is far greater than total natural influences considered, namely Changes in solar irradiance of 0.05 W/m squared, with a range of 0 to 0.10 and a level of confidence of Medium. . Of note, the base is relative to 1750, which roughly corresponds to the beginning of the use of fossil fuels in the industrial revolution.

Climate has been changing for hundreds of millions of years. There is little doubt that humans have some influence on climate change, particularly from land use changes. To state that, starting in 1951, human emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> overwhelmed natural influences without carefully producing the empirical evidence is absurd. As a minimum, the natural influences on climate, particularly warming periods of the past need to be carefully explained, not pushed aside as the Summary for Policymakers of the IPCC Third Assessment Report tried to do with Mr. Mann’s hockey-stick.

On her web site, Climate Etc., Judith Curry analyzes the jump in the IPCC's claimed certainty from AR4 to AR5 and finds the substantiation poor. Curry focuses on three periods in particular: 2000 to the present (the so-called hiatus); 1940 to 1970 (the so called grand hiatus, or a cooling period) and 1910 to 1940 (a warming period before the extensive use of fossil fuels. By choosing a period starting in 1951, the IPCC largely avoids having to explain these periods, which CO2 emissions just do not.

Tom Karl of NOAA, and coauthors, have adjusted the historic surface record in an effort to eliminate the so-called hiatus. However, criticism their effort is intensifying, and some of Karl's defenders are claiming political oppression of science. The claim is particularly rich when one realizes that the political defenders of Karl's efforts include those who remained quiet or joined-in on calls to politically investigate global warming skeptics who question the pronouncements of the IPCC and entities that support it.

The political stakes are high, with any lasting COP-21 agreement to control the use of fossil fuels based on predictions/projections/forecasts from un-validated climate models and the claimed IPCC certainty, which is not substantiated. These criticisms also apply to the Administration's plans to replace reliable electricity generated by fossil fuels with unreliable electricity generated by wind and solar, as well as the EPA's Endangerment Finding – that carbon dioxide emissions endanger human health and welfare. Without the Endangerment Finding, the Administration's plans have no justification and will economically implode. See links under Challenging the Orthodoxy, Problems in the Orthodoxy, Oh Mann! and [https://www.ipcc.ch/pdf/assessment-report/ar5/wg1/WG1AR5\\_SPM\\_FINAL.pdf](https://www.ipcc.ch/pdf/assessment-report/ar5/wg1/WG1AR5_SPM_FINAL.pdf), particularly Figure SPM.5, p. 14

\*\*\*\*\*

**Iatrogenic:** In a post related to the IPCC and the COP-21 in Climate Etc., Judith Curry brings up the concept of Iatrogenic climate policy. She states” “Iatrogenic: Due to the activity of a physician or therapy. For example, an iatrogenic illness is an illness that is caused by a medication or physician.” In the US there is a similar saying: “The cure is worse than the disease.”

Curry uses the term to discuss the upcoming Conference of Parties (COP-21) of the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), which will take place in Paris between November 30 and December 11, 2015. As Curry discusses, the UNFCCC desires to radically accelerate a transition from fossil fuels to different forms of “clean energy.” Often, wind and solar generation of electricity are called “clean energy,” but modern civilization does not function well on unreliable, untrustworthy electricity. As long as there is no available form of electricity storage, on a commercial scale other than pumped storage, which is geographically limited, there will be significant resistance to adapting to solar and wind power. Who would go to a hospital for a serious operation if the electricity failed frequently and unpredictably?

Experiences in Denmark, Germany, and the UK are demonstrating that solar and wind are expensive forms of electricity generation when the need for reliable power is included. Denmark and Germany have the highest electricity prices to consumers in Europe and the UK recently announced reductions in subsidies for solar and wind. UK is following similar reductions in subsidies that occurred in Spain and Italy. Very simply, the public is not tolerating the high costs. High costs of solar and wind are also resulting in a German energy policy that is focused on building coal-fired power plants using readily available brown coal, which has extensive wastes as compared to black coal, to replace nuclear power plants, which the government decided to eliminate.

The US Administration seems oblivious to what is occurring world-wide, but the US Congress is not. As of now, it appears that Congress will not fund the Administration's dreams of unreliable "clean power." The Administration may try many different political and word-play games. But for any plan to succeed it must be funded by Congress. This Congress seems to be more attentive to the real, known costs of energy transition than the imaginary costs of future climate change calculated from un-validated climate models. See Article # 1 and links under Questioning the Orthodoxy, On to Paris, The Administration's Plan – Push-Back, Problems in the Orthodoxy, Questioning European Green, and Subsidies and Mandates Forever.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Lowering Standards:** The Council of the American Physical Society (APS), "a non-profit membership organization working to advance the knowledge of physics", announced a National Policy Statement on the Earth's Changing Climate.

*"On Climate Change: Earth's changing climate is a critical issue and poses the risk of significant environmental, social and economic disruptions around the globe. While natural sources of climate variability are significant, multiple lines of evidence indicate that human influences have had an increasingly dominant effect on global climate warming observed since the mid-twentieth century. Although the magnitudes of future effects are uncertain, human influences on the climate are growing. The potential consequences of climate change are great and the actions taken over the next few decades will determine human influences on the climate for centuries.*

*"On Climate Science: As summarized in the 2013 report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), there continues to be significant progress in climate science. In particular, the connection between rising concentrations of atmospheric greenhouse gases and the increased warming of the global climate system is more compelling than ever. Nevertheless, as recognized by Working Group 1 of the IPCC, scientific challenges remain in our abilities to observe, interpret, and project climate changes. To better inform societal choices, the APS urges sustained research in climate science.*

*"On Climate Action: The APS reiterates its 2007 call to support actions that will reduce the emissions, and ultimately the concentration, of greenhouse gases as well as increase the resilience of society to a changing climate, and to support research on technologies that could reduce the climate impact of human activities. Because physics and its techniques are fundamental elements of climate science, the APS further urges physicists to collaborate with colleagues across disciplines in climate research and to contribute to the public dialogue."*

At least the statement recognizes that there is natural climate variability. The balance appears to more of a statement from a political entity copying the IPCC or the EPA's Endangerment Finding, with its lines of evidence (unspecified by the APS), than a statement from an objective scientific society.

When "the APS urges sustained research in climate science", TWTW can only ask is not more than \$40 Billion with no effort to validate a climate model enough? How much more is necessary to do the work properly?

When Judith Curry brought up the statement, she wrote she will not be renewing her membership. See links under Lowering Standards.

\*\*\*\*\*

**David Evans:** Jo Nova continues to post on her blog comments by David Evans on his criticism of the climate science expressed by the IPCC, with particular emphasis on the models used by the IPCC. Evans has written a synopsis of the 18 prior blog posts. Many of the 18 prior posts use mathematics to the extent that some interested readers are lost.

SEPP director Tom Sheahen read the synopsis and commented that Evans states the "basic architecture" of the conventional models is wrong, because Arrhenius (and all who followed) assumed that the response to more CO<sub>2</sub> would be the same as the response to more sunlight. Absolutely not, says Evans; there is a totally separate response to more CO<sub>2</sub> which causes other processes, notably the "re-routing" of escaping heat, which leaves via other pathways such as more radiation from water vapor in the upper troposphere. Evans insists that a "change of architecture" is needed to correct this error at a very basic level.

Having read this post # 19, Sheahen now sees where it is all headed, and is returning to post #1 to re-read the entire series. A comment on post # 19 brought in the "lapse rate", the same topic that Kyoji Kimoto dealt with (TWTW, Nov 14). Sheahen wrote "I'll make a bold prediction that there will someday be convergence of skeptical positions around these ideas." This effort by Evans may prove to be very fruitful. See links under Challenging the Orthodoxy.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Untethered:** Occasionally articles appear that proclaim wind power will be more reliable if the turbines are mounted on balloons far above the surface, much like anti-aircraft balloons (actually blimps) of World War II. In the past, John Brignell (being skeptical about the idea) asked how they will be adequately tethered (tied down.). The October 24th TWTW linked to another idea suggesting kites. Again, the same problem exists. Another issue is that the nacelle (housing, generator and gear box) of a "smaller" GE 1.5 megawatt model weighs more than 56 tons (51,000 kilos). Turbines mounted on blimps may be dangerous.

The military has been experimenting with blimps equipped with special gear to detect incoming cruise missiles. On October 28, one escaped Aberdeen Proving Ground in North East Maryland. According to reports, the dragging tethering lines snapped local power lines causing outages to about 20,000 customers. The surveillance blimp was quickly chased by F-16 fighter jets and finally descended in the Pennsylvania countryside, where it was dispatched by local police firing about 100 rounds from handguns.

According to the AP reports: "'My understanding is, from having seen these break loose in Afghanistan on a number of occasions, we could get it to descend and then we'll recover it and put it back up,' Defense Secretary Ash Carter said in a brief exchange with reporters at the Pentagon on Wednesday. 'This happens in bad weather.'" No doubt a 56 ton turbine would have added to the alarm. See link under Below the Bottom Line.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Number of the Week: \$16.5 Trillion:** The Climate Policy Initiative issued a report titled The Global Landscape of Climate Finance, which it called "The most comprehensive inventory of climate change investment available." The report states that total climate finance in 2014 came to \$391 Billion. It further states that over the next 15 years \$13.5 Trillion is needed to support pledges under the UNFCCC "Intended Nationally Determined Contributions" (INDC). A total of \$16.5 Trillion is needed in the next 15 years to limit the increase in temperature to 2°C – a contrived number based on estimates from un-validated climate models.

By way of comparison, the World Bank estimated the Gross Domestic Product of the US was \$17.420 Trillion in calendar year 2014. TWTW has not examined these estimates. But they are useful to understand the extent of financing the promoters of the UNFCCC hope to obtain. Those who claim skeptics are financed by oil companies should look at these types of financing. See links under Environmental Industry.

#####

**ARTICLES:** The Articles section is now at the bottom of TWTW.

#####

Please Note: Due to Travel, TWTW will be shorter than usual.

#####

### **NEWS YOU CAN USE:**

#### ***Suppressing Scientific Inquiry – The Witch Hunt – Push-Back***

##### **Lawsuit filed in the #RICO20 case against GMU for ‘denying’ records exist**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 16, 2015

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2015/11/16/lawsuit-filed-in-the-rico20-case-against-gmu-for-denying-records-exist/>

#### ***Challenging the Orthodoxy -- NIPCC***

##### **Climate Change Reconsidered II: Physical Science**

Idso, Carter, and Singer, Lead Authors/Editors, 2013

<https://www.heartland.org/media-library/pdfs/CCR-II/CCR-II-Full.pdf>

Summary: <http://www.nipccreport.org/reports/ccr2a/pdf/Summary-for-Policymakers.pdf>

##### **Climate Change Reconsidered II: Biological Impacts**

Idso, Idso, Carter, and Singer, Lead Authors/Editors, 2014

<http://www.nipccreport.org/reports/ccr2b/pdf/Full-Report.pdf>

Summary: <https://www.heartland.org/media-library/pdfs/CCR-IIb/Summary-for-Policymakers.pdf>

#### ***Challenging the Orthodoxy***

##### **Carbon Doesn't Kill — Poverty Does**

Dr. Jane Orient, IBC, Nov 16, 2015

<http://news.investors.com/ibd-editorials-viewpoint/111615-781028-epa-carbon-regulations-will-harm-many-and-benefit-none.htm?p=full>

##### **New Science 19b: A Synopsis**

By Jo Nova and David Evans, Her blog, Nov 15, 2015

<http://joannenova.com.au/2015/11/new-science-19b-a-synopsis/>

##### **Pre-Judging Paris**

By Bjørn Lomborg, visiting professor at the Copenhagen Business School and Director of the Copenhagen Consensus Center, Project Syndicate, Nov 17, 2015

<http://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/paris-climate-change-agreement-too-costly-by-bjorn-lomborg-2015-11>

##### **Prominent Scientists Declare Climate Claims Ahead of UN Summit ‘Irrational’ - ‘Based On Nonsense’**

By Staff Writers, ICECAP, Nov 20, 2015

[http://icecap.us/index.php/go/joes-blog/prominent\\_scientists\\_declare\\_climate\\_claims\\_ahead\\_of\\_un\\_summit\\_irrational\\_b/](http://icecap.us/index.php/go/joes-blog/prominent_scientists_declare_climate_claims_ahead_of_un_summit_irrational_b/)

### **“Massively Altered” ...German Professor Examines NASA GISS Temperature Datasets**

By P Gosselin, No Tricks Zone, Nov 20, 2015

<http://notrickszone.com/2015/11/20/german-professor-examines-nasa-giss-temperature-datasets-finds-they-have-been-massively-altered/#sthash.ibiNW4TW.WbFZCHST.dpbs>

### **A \$100,000 climate prize**

By Andrew Montford, Bishop Hill, Nov 18, 2015

<http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2015/11/18/a-100000-climate-prize.html>

[SEPP Comment: A contest to determine if a statistical analysis can determine whether a rise in temperatures due to human emissions in carbon dioxide is outside of random natural variation.]

### ***Defending the Orthodoxy***

#### **Why Climate Change and Terrorism Are Connected**

By Justin Worland, Time, Nov 15, 2015

<http://time.com/4113801/climate-change-terrorism/>

### **Claim: Earth’s climate more sensitive to CO2 than previously thought**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 16, 2015

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2015/11/16/claim-earths-climate-more-sensitive-to-co2-than-previously-thought/>

Link to paper: Eocene atmospheric CO2 from the nahcolite proxy

By Elliot A. Jagniecki, Tim K. Lowenstein, David M. Jenkins, and Robert V. Demicco, Geology, Oct 23, 2015

<http://geology.gsapubs.org/content/early/2015/10/23/G36886.1.abstract>

### ***Questioning the Orthodoxy***

#### **Iatrogenic (?) climate policy**

By Judith Curry, Climate Etc. Nov 18, 2015

<http://judithcurry.com/2015/11/18/iatrogenic-climate-policy/#more-20415>

### **Global Warming Solutions Same As Global Cooling Cures — Wait . . . What?**

Editorial, IBD, Nov 18, 2015 [H/t Timothy Wise]

<http://news.investors.com/ibd-editorials/111815-781449-global-warming-solutions-same-as-global-cooling-cures.htm>

### ***On to Paris!***

#### **Two Major Issues at Paris COP-21 that Are Not Likely to Be Resolved**

By Alan Carlin, Carlin Economics and Science, Nov 19, 2015

<http://www.carlineconomics.com/archives/2293>

1. Will the Proposed Agreement Be a Treaty? 2. Will the Agreement Mandate Large Payments to the LDCs?

### **Climate talks in Paris: India to stay firm on use of coal**

By Amitabh Sinha, The India Express, Nov 19, 2015 [H/t GWPF]

<http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-news-india/climate-talks-india-to-stay-firm-on-use-of-coal/>

## **Forget Terrorism, Paris Climate Summit To Focus On 'Real' Threat**

Editorial, IBD, Nov 17, 2015

<http://news.investors.com/ibd-editorials/111715-781300-forget-terrorism-paris-climate-summit-to-fight-biggest-threat.htm>

## **France bans [some] climate change protests**

By Staff Writers, Reuters, Nov 18, 2015 [H/t GWPF]

<http://www.echo.net.au/2015/11/france-bans-climate-change-protests/>

## **Memo to Paris: don't base policy on overblown prediction**

Guest essay by Christopher Monckton of Brenchley, WUWT, Nov 16, 2015

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2015/11/16/memo-to-paris-dont-base-policy-on-overblown-prediction/>

## ***The Administration's Plan – Push-Back***

### **Senate Votes to Overturn Clean Power Plan**

By Thomas Overton, Power Mag, Nov 17, 2015

[http://www.powermag.com/senate-votes-to-overturn-clean-power-plan/?hq\\_e=el&hq\\_m=3180843&hq\\_l=3&hq\\_v=5e660500d0](http://www.powermag.com/senate-votes-to-overturn-clean-power-plan/?hq_e=el&hq_m=3180843&hq_l=3&hq_v=5e660500d0)

## **How to halt the president's climate change ploy**

The Senate must assert that any new deal is non-binding

By Chris Horner, Washington Times, Nov 18, 2015

<http://m.washingtontimes.com/news/2015/nov/18/chris-horner-halting-obamas-climate-change-ploy/>

## ***Problems in the Orthodoxy***

### **India's Energy Challenge, Or Why Paris Climate Pledges Are Meaningless**

By Nick Butler, Financial Times, Nov 15, 2015

<http://www.thegwpf.com/indias-energy-challenge-or-why-paris-climate-pledges-are-meaningless/>

## **GOP warns Obama: No Senate approval, no funding for climate change deal**

By John Siciliano, Washington Examiner, Nov 18, 2015

<http://www.washingtonexaminer.com/gop-warns-obama-no-senate-approval-no-funding-for-climate-change-deal/article/2576652>

## **Republicans vow to deny Obama climate funds to derail Paris talks**

By Devin Henry, The Hill, Nov 20, 2015

<http://thehill.com/policy/energy-environment/260902-gop-vows-to-deny-obama-climate-funds-in-bid-to-derail-paris-talks>

## **As Terrorism Unites G-20, Climate Change Exposes Divisions**

By Raymond Colitt, Onur Ant, Ankara Wonk, & Arne Delfs, Bloomberg, Nov 15, 2015 [H/t GWPF]

<http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-11-15/france-said-to-push-for-tougher-climate-pledge-at-g-20-talks>

## ***Seeking a Common Ground***

**400(?) years of warming**

By Judith Curry, Climate Etc. Nov 16, 2015  
<http://judithcurry.com/2015/11/16/400-years-of-warming/>

### **Climate culture**

By Andy West, Climate Etc. Nov 20, 2015  
<http://judithcurry.com/2015/11/20/climate-culture/#more-20431>  
*[SEPP Comment: Lengthy post.]*

### **Model Issues**

#### **Why Climate Models Aren't Better**

Even as computer models grow more powerful and more precise, they remain uncertain as to regional effects.

By Richard Martin, MIT Technology Review, Nov 18, 2015  
<http://www.technologyreview.com/news/543546/why-climate-models-arent-better/>  
*[SEPP Comment: The author misses the point – the models cannot predict/project/forecast global temperature trends. Why would they do better on regional trends?]*

### **Measurement Issues**

#### **How can we be in a drought if there is flooding?**

By Cliff Mass, Weather Blog, Nov 19, 2015  
<http://cliffmass.blogspot.com/2015/11/how-can-there-be-flooding-when-we-are.html>

### **Changing Weather**

#### **NOAA: Deaths Caused by Severe Weather Hit 22-Year Low in 2014**

By Barbara Hollingsworth, CNS News, Nov 12, 2015 [H/t William Dwyer]  
<http://www.cnsnews.com/news/article/barbara-hollingsworth/noaa-2014-had-lowest-weather-related-deaths-23-years>

#### **Terrorism and a cold winter refugee crisis**

By Paul Driessen, Joe D'Aleo, Allan MacRae and Madhav Khandekar, ICECAP, Nov 19, 2015  
[http://icecap.us/index.php/go/new-and-cool/terrorism\\_and\\_a\\_cold\\_winter\\_refugee\\_crisis/](http://icecap.us/index.php/go/new-and-cool/terrorism_and_a_cold_winter_refugee_crisis/)

### **Changing Cryosphere – Land / Sea Ice**

#### **Threat Of Melting Antarctic Ice 'Has Been Exaggerated', New Study**

By Ben Webster, The Times, Via GWPF, Nov 19, 2015  
<http://www.thegwpf.com/threat-of-melting-antarctic-ice-has-been-exaggerated-new-study/>  
Link to paper, Potential sea-level rise from Antarctic ice-sheet instability constrained by observations

By Ritz, Edwards, et al, Nature, Nov 18, 2015  
<http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/vaop/ncurrent/full/nature16147.html>

### **Lowering Standards**

#### **APS Statement on Climate Change**

15.3 Statement on Earth's Changing Climate  
By APS Council, Nov 14, 2015 [H/t Climate Etc.]  
[http://www.aps.org/policy/statements/15\\_3.cfm](http://www.aps.org/policy/statements/15_3.cfm)

#### **BBC: Inform, Educate And Confuse**

By David Whitehouse, GWPF, Nov 18, 2015

<http://www.thegwpf.com/bbc-inform-educate-and-confuse/>

**BBC: "To hell with your charter obligations"**

By Andrew Montford, Bishop Hill, Nov 18, 2015

<http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2015/11/18/bbc-to-hell-with-your-charter-obligations.html>

***Communicating Better to the Public – Make things up.***

**Does Climate Change Actually Fuel Terrorism?**

By Patrick J. Michaels and Christopher A. Preble, Cato, (Huffington Post), Nov 18, 2015

<http://www.cato.org/publications/commentary/does-climate-change-actually-fuel-terrorism>

[SEPP Comment: *Exposing false claims.*]

**HuffPo: Combating Climate Change Is ‘Best Way to Fight ISIS’**

By Oliver Lane, Breitbart, Nov 16, 2015

<http://www.breitbart.com/london/2015/11/16/huffpo-combating-climate-change-best-way-fight-isis/>

“The French edition of the Huffington Post went full-Guardian with its response to Friday’s massacre in Paris, insisting there were ‘several undeniable links between these barbaric and fascist acts by radical Islamists and the climate’.”

***Communicating Better to the Public – Go Personal.***

**Jeff Goldblum mocks 'selfish, reptilian' opponents of Obama climate rule**

By Timothy Cama, The Hill, Nov 19, 2015

<http://thehill.com/policy/energy-environment/260802-greens-enlist-big-stars-for-video-mocking-epa-foes>

“Instead, Goldblum says the regulations are easily to comply with, a top talking point from green groups like LCV.” [League of Conservation Voters]

[SEPP Comment: *Apparently, this Hollywood personality has no concept of the cost of solar and wind to electricity consumers in Denmark and Germany.*]

***Expanding the Orthodoxy***

**Climate Engineering Economics**

By Heutel, Moreno-Cruz, and Ricke, NBER, Nov 2015 [H/t Climate Etc.]

[http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=2691229](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2691229)

***Questioning European Green***

**German CO2 emissions targets at risk**

A new coal-fired power plant has opened in Germany a day after an expert commission told the energy minister the country must triple its annual rate of decarbonization to meet its ambitious 2020 climate policy goals.

By Nils Zimmermann, Deutsche Welle, Nov 19, 2015 [H/t GWPF]

<http://www.dw.com/en/german-co2-emissions-targets-at-risk/a-18862708>

***The Political Games Continue***

**Congressman now threatens to subpoena commerce secretary over global warming report**

By Lisa Rein, Washington Post, Nov 18, 2015

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/federal-eye/wp/2015/11/18/congressional-climate-change-skeptic-threatens-to-subpoena-commerce-secretary-to-get-noaa-documents/>

## **Dem accuses GOP chairman of ‘witch hunt’ in climate probe**

By Timothy Cama, The Hill, Nov 20, 2015

<http://thehill.com/policy/energy-environment/260922-dem-accuses-gop-chairman-of-witch-hunt-harassment-in-climate>

“A NOAA official said the agency’s scientific integrity office has not received any complaints about scientific misconduct related to the study, or any such complaints so far this year.”

## ***Subsidies and Mandates Forever***

### **Amber Rudd: end to pursuit of green energy at all costs**

Keeping the lights on is now top priority, energy secretary to say, as she warns that households face paying over the odds for energy for years to come due to poor value green subsidies handed out by her predecessors

By Emily Gosden, Telegraph, UK, Nov 15, 2015

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/earth/energy/11994954/Amber-Rudd-end-to-pursuit-of-green-energy-at-all-costs.html>

*[SEPP Comment: The need to keep the bills down may become more important than subsidizing green power.]*

## **Green Tech and the climate crisis syndicate**

Guest essay by Paul Driessen, WUWT, Nov 16, 2015

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2015/11/16/green-tech-and-the-climate-crisis-syndicate/>

## **Let Wind and Solar Energy Subsidies Expire**

By Lloyd Bentsen, NCPA, November 11, 2015

<http://environmentblog.ncpa.org/let-wind-and-solar-energy-subsidies-expire/>

“Wind energy is doing very well... Apparently, solar energy is now more affordable. If solar energy is now affordable, then the federal subsidies are no longer needed. These federal subsidies have provided wind and solar developers with as much as \$24 billion from 2008 to 2014.”

## ***EPA and other Regulators on the March***

### **EPA proposes fix to air pollution rule after Supreme Court loss**

By Timothy Cama, The Hill, Nov 20, 2015

<http://thehill.com/policy/energy-environment/260976-epa-proposes-fix-to-air-pollution-rule-after-supreme-court-loss>

## ***Energy Issues – Non-US***

### **Wind and solar farms must pay their true costs, energy secretary Amber Rudd vows**

Amber Rudd says wind and solar must bear the burden of dealing with their intermittency and says UK could double its offshore wind capacity if costs come down

By Emily Gosden, Telegraph, UK, Nov 18, 2015

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/finance/newsbysector/energy/12004458/Wind-and-solar-farms-must-pay-their-true-costs-energy-secretary-vows.html>

## **Stuff their mouths with gold**

By Andrew Montford, Bishop Hill, Nov 18, 2015

<http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2015/11/18/stuff-their-mouths-with-gold.html>

*[SEPP Comment: Montford recognizes he may have been premature to express an opinion on a political speech based on a report in the Guardian. Afterwards, Montford states the UK has an*

*electrical system “where no form of power generation, not even gas-fired power stations, can be built without government intervention.”]*

### ***Energy Issues -- US***

#### **Energy Efficiency Fiction**

By Donn Dears, Power For USA, Nov 17, 2015

<https://dddusmma.wordpress.com/2015/11/17/energy-efficiency-fiction-2/>

#### **Why Coal Burners Don't Totally Hate Obama's Climate Plan**

By Mark Chediak, Bloomberg, Nov 13, 2015

<http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-11-13/why-coal-burners-don-t-totally-hate-obama-s-climate-plan>

*[SEPP Comment: Apparently the author does not realize that regulated utilities will make profits no matter how unreliable or costly the electricity sources are.]*

### ***Washington's Control of Energy***

#### **No Keystone, No Problem: TransCanada Turns to Mexico Expansion**

By Adam Williams and Rebecca Penty, Bloomberg, Nov 17, 2015

<http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-11-17/no-keystone-no-problem-transcanada-turns-to-mexico-expansion?cmpid=yhoo.headline>

### ***Oil and Natural Gas – the Future or the Past?***

#### **3 Recent Oil and Gas Discoveries You Probably Missed**

The world might be oversupplied with oil right now, but that's not stopping explorers from searching for more of it.

By Matthew DiLallo, Motley Fool, Nov 17, 2015

<http://www.fool.com/investing/general/2015/11/17/3-recent-oil-and-gas-discoveries-you-probably-miss.aspx>

### ***Nuclear Energy and Fears***

#### **Cheap Gas Is Killing Nuclear Power, and the Outlook is Grim**

By Thomas Overton, Power Mag, Nov 17, 2015

<http://www.powermag.com/cheap-gas-is-killing-nuclear-power-and-the-outlook-is-grim/>

### ***Alternative, Green (“Clean”) Solar and Wind***

#### **Is The Cleantech Bubble Over? The Curse of Intangibles**

By Michael Lynch, Forbes, Nov 13, 2015

<http://www.forbes.com/sites/michaelynch/2015/11/13/is-the-cleantech-bubble-over-1-the-curse-of-intangibles/?ss=energy>

*[SEPP Comment: The author does not address the main issue – the unreliability of solar and wind and the cost of back-up needed when they fail.]*

### ***Alternative, Green (“Clean”) Vehicles***

#### **Absurdity of Zero-Emission-Vehicles**

By Donn Dears, Power For USA, Nov 20, 2015

<https://dddusmma.wordpress.com/2015/11/20/absurdity-of-zero-emission-vehicles/>

### **Electric Vehicles On Verge Of Making Auto — And Energy — History**

By Mark Perry, IBD, Nov 20, 2015

<http://news.investors.com/ibd-editorials-perspective/112015-781887-electric-vehicles-about-to-make-auto-and-energy-history.htm?p=full>

“The cost of lithium-ion batteries — which account for one-third of an EV’s price tag — has dropped sharply in recent years.”

[SEPP Comment: Future sales depend on a number of questionable assumptions including the cost and availability of electricity for re-charging.]

***Oh Mann!***

**A new edition of the Hockey Stick Illusion**

By Andrew Montford, Bishop Hill, Nov 18, 2015

<http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2015/11/18/a-new-edition-of-the-hockey-stick-illusion.html>

Details: <http://www.bishop-hill.net/the-hockey-stick-illusion/>

Available on Kindle

***Environmental Industry***

**The \$400-Billion-A-Year Global Warming Industrial Complex**

By Michael Bastasch, Daily Caller, Nov 16, 2015

<http://dailycaller.com/2015/11/16/the-400-billion-a-year-global-warming-industrial-complex/>

Link to report: The Global Landscape of Climate Finance

By Bucher, Trabacchi, Mazza, Abramskiehn and Wang, Climate Policy Initiative, November 2015

<http://www.climatefinancelandscape.org/>

***Other Scientific News***

**The Space Doctor’s Big Idea**

By Randall Munroe, New Yorker, Nov 18, 2015 [H/t Climate Etc.]

<http://www.newyorker.com/tech/elements/the-space-doctors-big-idea-einstein-general-relativity>

From Climate Etc.: “This is a great exercise in simplifying difficult subjects. General relativity using only the 1,000 most-common words.”

#####

**BELOW THE BOTTOM LINE:**

***LOST & FOUND:***

**Lohachara island lost**

By Staff Writers, Climate Change Predictions.org, Nov 14, 2015

<http://climatechangepredictions.org/uncategorized/5433>

*The Independent, 24 Dec 2006*

**Lohachara island found**

By Staff Writers, Climate Change Predictions.org, Nov 14, 2015

<http://climatechangepredictions.org/uncategorized/5433>

*The Times of India, 3 Apr 2009*

**Gunshots help deflate runaway military blimp in Pennsylvania**

By Staff Writers, CBS News, Oct 29, 2015

<http://www.cbsnews.com/news/gunshots-deflate-runaway-military-blimp-in-pennsylvania/>

#####

**ARTICLES:**

Please note that articles not linked easily or summarized here are reproduced in the Articles Section of the full TWTW that can be found on the web site under the date of the TWTW.

## Why the Paris Climate Talks Won't Amount to Much

By Jeffrey Ball, WSJ, Nov 19, 2015

<http://blogs.wsj.com/experts/2015/11/19/why-the-paris-climate-talks-wont-amount-to-much/>

SUMMARY: The former environment editor and energy reporter for the newspaper now writes about energy and heads a project exploring the relationships among countries in the globalizing clean-energy industry. Mr Ball writes that the environmental movement thrives on symbolism, but that is no substitute for substance. Two distinctions are important to what will happen in Paris – geography and politics. Virtually all the growth in energy consumption, fossil fuel consumption, will occur in China and India. They want growth. The rest is fluff: “To use a theater analogy, the developing countries are the actors in the climate show—and the rich countries are merely the stage hands.”

In politics, Kyoto failed to produce an agreement that limited growth that developing countries want. “Ever since then, climate partisans have pursued another global agreement, this time one with teeth enough to force deeper carbon cuts. Those efforts have failed.

*“Today, calls for Paris to produce another big global climate treaty amount to hot air.*

*In the lead-up to Paris, the U.S., China and many other countries have proffered voluntary commitments to curb the growth in their emissions.*

*“Two things about these commitments are worth keeping in mind: They would produce only limited climate progress, and they’re climate pledges only tangentially. Countries are peddling in the name of climate change policies that they have come to endorse for reasons they see as more domestically compelling: boosting jobs, spurring technological innovation, combating smoggy air.*

*“The distinction underscores that Paris is likely to produce carbon cuts only to the extent that individual countries see cutting carbon as a way to make their domestic economies more competitive.”*

#####